| **Student Name:** James Gao |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This House would place an emphasis on holistic learning over standardised testing in schools |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 68.5 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  We need to have strong openings. We’ve talked about this before, but if we keep repeating the motion, or even jumping straight to set-up, what is our opening doing for impact on the judge?  Set-up   * Clear definition. We need to also include our framing, as well as our burden and stance. We need to push a burden and comparative onto the other side. * We need to explain how schooling will shift if schools move towards this philosophy.   Argument 1   * Thesis? What will we prove here? * We need to explain why an academic focus is always likely to be stressful or exhausting; why is it inherently pressuring? For instance, why won’t this new poker or bridge club you talk about also be graded on, or treated like a serious subject? * Why is your case exclusive from or different to just having academic learning at school, but encouraging many hobbies? * I buy it is good for well-being, but I am unsure about the scale and exclusivity of this solution. We need to focus on reasoning this out, rather than what is likely to be accepted in the round as stress-relief.   03:27 - we need to be able to hit four!  We need to ask POIs consistently. This comment applies to everyone in class! | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Carine Yeung |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This House would place an emphasis on holistic learning over standardised testing in schools. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 68.5 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  I’m aware this is what the debate is about; tell me what I need to know or hear; for instance that there is no newness or difference from status quo on Prop’s case. We eventually get to this, but why not just open with it and then transition to our set-up and responses? The takeaway shouldn’t be double examination, but that holistic means that these facets become treated as serious subjects, adding to stress rather than keeping these as a means of stress relief.  Where is the signposting and where is the set-up? What is the counterfactual? What does your side support?  Rebuttal   * When did they say they would abandon it all, or minimise subjects? If we think this is what they are required to do, you need to explain this. Otherwise, it comes across as uncharitable!   Argument 1   * What will you prove here? What is the thesis? * Why will teachers behave in this way? Why will it be taught so poorly? This is an assumption your impact rests on - you need to prove this.   Argument 2   * Why would learning become unstructured in Prop’s world?   Our case is about why holistic learning is bad, rather than an explanation of the benefits of standardised testing. We actually don’t mention standardised testing at all?  03:47  We need to ask POIs consistently. This comment applies to everyone in class! | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Jenny Zong |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This House would place an emphasis on holistic learning over standardised testing in schools. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | **1** | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 67.5 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Call them out for not even mentioning standardised testing! Our opening reads as pre-written, rather than directly responsive to the speaker before us.  Signposting missing.  Rebuttal   * What they’re saying is that it becomes stressful too when it becomes an actual subject, compared to a hobby - you need to engage with this. * We barely had any responses! * You need to challenge their claims about how holistic learning leads to more stress, or makes learning more unstructured. We ignored these claims entirely!   Argument 1   * You need to first establish what a focus on standardised testing looks like. We just claim it’ll be stressful, but don’t really explain it. * What did we prove here?   Argument 2   * How is this new or different; as a second speaker, should we be running two arguments? * We can incorporate this analysis into our rebuttal. We still need to explain why holistic learning gets adopted in this specific way - where it isn’t a subject that is tested on. Why is your case exclusive from or different to just having academic learning at school, but encouraging many hobbies? * We need to explain how schooling will shift if schools move towards this philosophy; and why interest gets kept in.   03:32 - we need to look back at our notes and consider what the structure and responsibility of a second speaker is.  We need to ask POIs consistently. This comment applies to everyone in class! | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Renee Yang |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This House would place an emphasis on holistic learning over standardised testing in schools. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 68.5 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Why is this true; why will it be taught in this specific way? You need to establish why implementation is poor or occurs in this specific way for me to buy this.  Signposting missing.  Rebuttal   * Good on shift in learning system. Explain why the lack of set-up from Proposition means they cannot access their benefits; is it still stress relieving when you now also get tested on this? What is the implication here? What is your positive comparative, for instance that hobbies get safeguarded, rather than turning into avenues of stress? * Did we respond enough to be able to go into our argument at 1:38?   Argument 1   * Why does holistic learning occur in this way? What does it mean to focus on testing? * Is this different from what the first speaker says? * Why will teachers behave in this way? Why will it be taught so poorly? This is an assumption your impact rests on - you need to prove this. * How does your side get uniqueness? Our case is about why holistic learning is bad, rather than an explanation of the benefits of standardised testing. We actually don’t mention standardised testing at all?   03:34  We need to ask POIs consistently. This comment applies to everyone in class! | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Jacky Xu |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This House would place an emphasis on holistic learning over standardised testing in schools. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 69 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Why is this correct - start by clarifying what holistic learning is and how it gets implemented within schools. Explain why it will be done well, such that it takes out the harms Opp tries to run throughout.  Clash names needed in signposting. We said we had clashes but did we? We didn’t mark when we started them, or said what we would prove within it.  We need to establish what a focus on standardised learning has been - and link it to the lack of a positive case from Opp. They haven’t explained at all why SL is good or positive. Good response to the POI.  Explain why they are forced - what culture or kind of test is SL? For instance, right and wrong, clear scores, percentiles and rankings. Ask what matters or is necessary for societal and child development. Good reference to mental health crisis - we need to blow this up further.  We need to explain why an academic focus is always likely to be stressful or exhausting; why is it inherently pressuring? For instance, why won’t this new poker or bridge club you talk about also be graded on, or treated like a serious subject? Why is your case exclusive from or different to just having academic learning at school, but encouraging many hobbies?  I buy it is good for well-being, but I am unsure about the scale and exclusivity of this solution. We need to focus on reasoning this out, rather than what is likely to be accepted in the round as stress-relief.  04:03  We need to ask POIs consistently. This comment applies to everyone in class! | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Edna Chow |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This House would place an emphasis on holistic learning over standardised testing in schools. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 68.5 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Our opening is too long without being punchy! We need to explain why holistic learning is taught in this poor or horrible manner, as your team’s impacts are contingent on this.  Clashes need to be named; you cannot claim to have them but not tell me what they are, or mark your transition into and out of them.  Fair on the value of academics; you need to explain why it must stay this way. Explain why the lack of set-up from Proposition means they cannot access their benefits; is it still stress relieving when you now also get tested on this? What is the implication here? What is your positive comparative, for instance that hobbies get safeguarded, rather than turning into avenues of stress?  Why is this true; why will it be taught in this specific way? You need to establish why implementation is poor or occurs in this specific way for me to buy this. Is it true social skills are taught in this way?  On practicality - why should the world remain this way; you need to explain why it’s good that this occurs or is needed, rather than saying this is just how the world is.  04:04  We need to ask POIs consistently. This comment applies to everyone in class! | | | | | | |